

Evaluation Report

This evaluation report is regarding Krista Galyen’s Flash project, “SmartSigner Memory” game.

Part One: User Observations and Summary

A. User Observations

PARTICIPANT SUMMARY				
		Participant 1	Participant 2	Participant 3
User Profile	Age/Gender	Female, age 63	Male, age 34	Female, age 7
	Internet Experience	Uses a computer on a daily basis and internet for job-related tasks such as word, email, and general internet searches. She’s not super comfortable with complex tasks and gets nervous easily.	Very experienced internet user.	Her father is a web designer, therefore she’s fairly savvy with computers and technology for her age group.
	Profession	Secretary	Multimedia legal support	Child/Student
Test Context	Usability Test Method	direct observation	direct observation	direct observation
	Date of Test	7/26/07	7/26/07	7/25/07
	Platform/Browser	Mac OS X, Firefox	Linux, Firefox	Mac OS X, Safari

SUMMARY OF OBSERVATIONS			
	Task 1	Task 2	Task 3
Task Description	Try selecting a number of cards to play.	Try to match up some cards that you see.	Try stopping and starting sound

SUMMARY OF OBSERVATIONS			
Time Spent to Complete the Task	Users spent anywhere from one second to a few seconds figuring it out.	Users spent anywhere from 30 seconds to 1 minute, mainly because the cards weren't working correctly.	1 to 5 seconds
Difficulty Rating in completing the Task	2	3	1
Errors or problems identified by the user	One initially wanted to click on it rather than drag it; the other younger child didn't read the directions and was licking it also.	Non-matching cards don't flip back down. Matching cards disappear way too quickly. Many cards only show white backgrounds, and many of them (if choose over 4 cards) show "undefined".	The sound goes away when it is started again. The sound has different levels throughout, and it made one user stop playing the game and try to figure out what was wrong.
Overall user comments (likes and dislikes)	One said it was her favorite part of the game. All three of them liked the idea of putting the card into the hands, even though it wasn't as intuitive for them as clicking a card.	They really liked the sound and even though the piece didn't work for them, they all were excited for it to get up and running. Even though it didn't work, they all ran through it 2 or 3 times. (That's a plus).	The sound is OK; one thought the music was too loud. One said they liked the music, another said they thought it was a bit annoying.

1 = easy, 2 = okay, 3 = difficult

B. Usability Form Summary*

For the most part, people generally liked the idea as well as the overall interaction with the Flash website. However, it was the "glitches" that made it difficult and somewhat frustrating and/or confusing for the user.

Explanation of negative ratings:

1. Navigation: navigation didn't have the ability to jump anywhere from anywhere, and required a user to refresh when at the end. Two of my users didn't know about refresh, and were "stuck" at one point.

2. Not performing as expected: Users expected a fully functioning glitch-free experience, since that is what they get all the time (and should get!). Most of their confusion came from the cards not working appropriately. Some other confusion came from the sound not working, some navigation being inconsistent or not working as well.

3. Easy to determine my location in the Flash website: As stated earlier, it was very difficult for users to go back to a certain location, or they felt like it was one long stream of "stuff".

4. Technical functioning: Many users were confused with the video not loading fast enough (they didn't realize that's what it was, they just knew something was supposed to be on the card but nothing was there). Audio levels tended to change and be confusing to one user.

5. Forming a cohesive program: They felt it would have felt more cohesive if the main part of the game worked, along with the navigation. As it is, it felt like non-working parts stuck together.

6. Overall experience: I think users tended to give a bit of a high score for this. For the most part, they were so excited to play with it, even though it was not fully functional, that they rated it higher than I would have expected. Most everyone stated they were excited to see it working.

Summary of Usability Form Ratings	
	Average Rating (rounded to nearest integer)
I think the Flash website was easy to use and navigate.	3
I was not overwhelmed by the numerous options and complexity of the Flash website.	4
The Flash website performed the way I expected.	2
I found it easy to determine my location in the Flash website.	2
I thought the design was pleasing.	4
The content was easy to understand and was aligned with the purpose of the Flash website.	4
I found the technical functioning very good regarding audio, video, animation speed, and content display.	2
The media (text, audio, video, and animation) work together to form one cohesive program.	3
My overall experience with the Flash program was very good.	3
Total:	27/45

* Numbers were interpreted for the child user based on her answers she gave as to what she thought about the questions; the questions had also a slightly different wording. Some questions were not given to her if they could not be asked at a cognitively appropriate manner.

C. Project Changes

Summary of Usability Form Ratings

Source (UT, PE)	Issue Priority (Low, Med, High)	Issue Description	Recommendation	Changed (Yes/No)
UT	Low	Website says "type your name" but there is no textbox.	Create a text box that remembers the user's name.	Yes, added and working.
UT	High	"Rules" and "Quit" button don't play on main screen	Implement the buttons and do testing to make sure they work throughout the site.	Yes. They were changed from the front and
PE	Med	"Go back" button (wording) not intuitive	Get rid of it in favor of a better overall navigational system.	Yes.
UT	High	Only the "4" Card works; the others (8, 14, 20) do not.	Have PHP and Flash communicate as to the rest of the 3 cards.	Yes. Implemented a sendAndLoad.
UT	High	Movie clips load slowly	Look into load times	Yes...somewhat. I downsized files, but could not implement a loader as planned (complex)
UT	High	When pressing start, it plays the music over again, or the button does not work at all.	Look at ActionScript and implement a solution for the button; don't go back to very beginning)	Yes; utilizing frames and AS this problem was fixed.
UT, PE	High	The "Quit" button does not work.	Get rid of the front "quit" button in favor of a top menu that is throughout the entire movie.	Yes.
UT, PE	High	The "Quit" button works once, but then does not work again.	Look at the coding and fix Actionscript.	Yes; it now works.
PE	High	Confusion regarding the "flipping" of cards; took him a while to figure out what he was supposed to do.	Create a "How to Play" section where people can be introduced to the game before they play.	Yes.
PE	Low	Music catchy, but slightly bothersome.	Change the music.	No. It's very difficult to find good, catchy loops (and more difficult to make one's own). Hopefully that will be in the future as well.
UT	Med	Sound suddenly lowers during the game play; confused some users.	Make the sound fade in/out.	Yes. I lowered the sound throughout for consistency.

Summary of Usability Form Ratings				
UT, PE	High	“Undefined” on some cards; others are white/no display.	Work on PHP integration to make sure cards are getting the needed information.	Yes, for the most part. :) Still needs some sort of loader for dynamic .flv loading times.
PE	Med	Too much text; too much copy to read at first. Conflicting text sizes.	Get rid of unwanted text and/or create more white space.	Yes.
PE	Med	“Let’s go” is a choppy/sloppy animation	Re-animate the movie to be slicker (up the frame rate and add more frames).	Yes/No. That animation was deleted since it was found to be not necessary.
PE	High	Beginning splashed some hidden movies; looked odd.	Use attachMovie() instead of hiding the movie.	Yes. However, attachMovie() and visibility used.
UT	High	Some dynamic text cut off for “How many cards would you like?”	Make it multi-line and make sure the text box is large enough to hold 2 lines’ worth.	Yes.
PE	Low	Difficult to get into the site; make it for the general public	Implement a general access one that has set cards.	No. Currently needs a smart-Signer account due to the program depending on PHP SESSIONS.
PE	High	No Heirarchy to the site, need to create some sort of general flow to the site.	Create menu at the top which gives the user a sense of heirarchy and flow.	Yes. Placed all menu items on top to form clear heirarchy and flow.

Part Two: Evaluation Summary

A. Summary of Peer Evaluations

Summary of Peer Evaluations		
Description	Avg. Points (1 to 5)	Comments
NAVIGATION: Interface is intuitive, interactions meaningful, and user is able to navigate easily to different parts of the movie	4	Quit button doesn’t work; interactions are meaningful. Wants to see some instructions on how to perform matching. Difficult to get around, needs some hierarchy.
CONTENT: Language is familiar and comfortable for intended audience.	5	Very rich content. Very easy to understand.

Summary of Peer Evaluations

VISUAL DESIGN: Colors, backgrounds, buttons, text work together to crete a clear and easy viewing experience.	4	Colors work well together. Layout is clean and inviting. Title is conflicting with “SmartSigner” heading.
ANIMATION QUALITY: Animations work smoothly and appropriately.	4	Opening animation is a bit clunky.
TECHNICAL PERFORMANCE: All multimedia elements worked appropriately.	3	The memory game aspect needs to be fixed. Matching not working. Many buttons not working correctly. Overall missing many elements.
OVERALL CRITIQUE: Overall impression of the project on requirements and creativity.	4	Great idea especially considering the level of difficulty. Love the idea and the signing video clips are “cool”. Can’t wait to see when it’s done. Very ambitious.
Total:	24/30	

5=Excellent, 4=Very Good, 3=Good, 2=Acceptable, 1=Minimal, 0=Unacceptable

B. Project Changes

(Please see Part One, Project Changes. They are included in the summary there. “PE” is labeled in bold for your convenience.)

C. Project Recommendations

The following recommendations I would implement (and hope to implement) in the future:

- A loader for the cards and the dynamic .flv files that are being loaded. That way, the user will not start clicking until all have been loaded.
- ActionScript to de-activate the other cards once two have been clicked. That way, only two cards at a time can be clicked (preventing user misuse).
- More advanced animations. For example, some more animations for the cards flipping, and the bag full of cards (make it better.)
- Less “annoying” loop music, possibly two different kinds (one for the intro, one for the game).